

OPINION

Today's Paper Video Columns Blogs Graphics Newsletters & Alerts New! Journal Community



Subscriber Log In

HOME U.S. WORLD BUSINESS MARKETS TECH PERSONAL FINANCE LIFE & STYLE OPINION CAREERS LEISURE & ARTS LETTERS TO THE EDITOR DISCUSSION GROUPS POLITICAL DIARY COLU

TOP STORIES IN Opinion



1 of 10 Everybody Else Did It



2 of 10 Sol Stern: Ayers Is No Education 'Ref...



OPINION | SEPTEMBER 23, 2008

Blame Fannie Mae and Congress For the Credit Mess

By CHARLES W. CALOMIRIS and PETER J. WALLISON

Article

Email Printer Friendly Share: Yahoo Buzz Text Size

Many monumental errors and misjudgments contributed to the acute financial turmoil in which we now find ourselves. Nevertheless, the vast accumulation of toxic mortgage debt that poisoned the global financial system was driven by the aggressive buying of subprime and Alt-A mortgages, and mortgage-backed securities, by Fannie Mae and Freddie Mac. The poor choices of these two government-sponsored enterprises (GSEs) -- and their sponsors in Washington -- are largely to blame for our current mess.

How did we get here? Let's review: In order to curry congressional support after their accounting scandals in 2003 and 2004, Fannie Mae and Freddie Mac committed to increased financing of "affordable housing." They became the largest buyers of subprime and Alt-A mortgages between 2004 and 2007, with total GSE exposure eventually exceeding \$1 trillion. In doing so, they stimulated the growth of the subpar mortgage market and substantially magnified the costs of its collapse.

It is important to understand that, as GSEs, Fannie and Freddie were viewed in the capital markets as government-backed buyers (a belief that has now been reduced to fact). Thus they were able to borrow as much as they wanted for the purpose of buying mortgages and mortgage-backed securities. Their buying patterns and interests were followed closely in the markets. If Fannie and Freddie wanted subprime or Alt-A loans, the mortgage markets would produce them. By late 2004, Fannie and Freddie very much wanted subprime and Alt-A loans. Their accounting had just been revealed as fraudulent, and they were under pressure from Congress to demonstrate that they deserved their considerable privileges. Among other problems, economists at the Federal Reserve and Congressional Budget Office had begun to study them in detail, and found that -- despite their subsidized borrowing rates -- they did not

Advertisement for Dell with text: 'WHA WAIT', 'Make the M with Confic', 'Windows Vis Small Busine: Assurance', and the Dell logo.

Email Newsletter

The latest news and ; boxes below to sign u

- On the Editorial F
Also send me informa

Enter Your Email Add

Terms and Conditions |

significantly reduce mortgage interest rates. In the wake of Freddie's 2003 accounting scandal, Fed Chairman Alan Greenspan became a powerful opponent, and began to call for stricter regulation of the GSEs and limitations on the growth of their highly profitable, but risky, retained portfolios.

If they were not making mortgages cheaper and were creating risks for the taxpayers and the economy, what value *were* they providing? The answer was their affordable-housing mission. So it was that, beginning in 2004, their portfolios of subprime and Alt-A loans and securities began to grow. Subprime and Alt-A originations in the U.S. rose from less than 8% of all mortgages in 2003 to over 20% in 2006. During this period the quality of subprime loans also declined, going from fixed rate, long-term amortizing loans to loans with low down payments and low (but adjustable) initial rates, indicating that originators were scraping the bottom of the barrel to find product for buyers like the GSEs.

The strategy of presenting themselves to Congress as the champions of affordable housing appears to have worked. Fannie and Freddie retained the support of many in Congress, particularly Democrats, and they were allowed to continue unrestrained. Rep. Barney Frank (D., Mass), for example, now the chair of the House Financial Services Committee, openly described the "arrangement" with the GSEs at a committee hearing on GSE reform in 2003: "Fannie Mae and Freddie Mac have played a very useful role in helping to make housing more affordable . . . a mission that this Congress has given them in return for some of the arrangements which are of some benefit to them to focus on affordable housing." The hint to Fannie and Freddie was obvious: Concentrate on affordable housing and, despite your problems, your congressional support is secure.

In light of the collapse of Fannie and Freddie, both John McCain and Barack Obama now criticize the risk-tolerant regulatory regime that produced the current crisis. But Sen. McCain's criticisms are at least credible, since he has been pointing to systemic risks in the mortgage market and trying to do something about them for years. In contrast, Sen. Obama's conversion as a financial reformer marks a reversal from his actions in previous years, when he did nothing to disturb the status quo. The first head of Mr. Obama's vice-presidential search committee, Jim Johnson, a former chairman of Fannie Mae, was the one who announced Fannie's original affordable-housing program in 1991 -- just as Congress was taking up the first GSE regulatory legislation.

In 2005, the Senate Banking Committee, then under Republican control, adopted a strong reform bill, introduced by Republican Sens. Elizabeth Dole, John Sununu and Chuck Hagel, and supported by then chairman Richard Shelby. The bill prohibited the GSEs from holding portfolios, and gave their regulator prudential authority (such as setting capital requirements) roughly equivalent to a bank regulator. In light of the current financial crisis, this bill was probably the most important piece of financial regulation before Congress in 2005 and 2006. All the Republicans on the Committee supported the bill, and all the Democrats voted against it. Mr. McCain endorsed the legislation in a speech on the Senate floor. Mr. Obama, like all other Democrats, remained silent.

Now the Democrats are blaming the financial crisis on "deregulation." This is a canard. There has indeed been deregulation in our economy -- in long-distance telephone rates, airline fares, securities brokerage and trucking, to name just a few -- and this has produced much innovation and lower consumer prices. But the primary "deregulation" in the financial world in the last 30 years permitted banks to diversify their risks geographically and across different products,

People Who V

On WSJ.com [In](#)

[Presidential Debate, Fi](#)

[McCain Links Ayers an](#)

[McCain: 'I Am Not Pre](#)

[Buckley Is Out at Natic](#)

[Dispatch From Iceland](#)

Video

[McCain's Katrina Moment](#)
3:30

More in Opinio

[Everybody Else Dic](#)

[Sol Stern: Ayers Is](#)

[Karl Rove: Obama](#)

['Senator Governme](#)

[Conservative Cana](#)

Most Popular

[Read](#) [Emailed](#) \

1. [My Frien](#)
2. [U.S. Force](#)
3. [Dow Declines](#)
4. [Democrats M](#)
5. [Opinion : Oba](#)

[Most Read Articles F](#)

which is one of the things that has kept banks relatively stable in this storm.

As a result, U.S. commercial banks have been able to attract more than \$100 billion of new capital in the past year to replace most of their subprime-related write-downs. Deregulation of branching restrictions and limitations on bank product offerings also made possible bank acquisition of Bear Stearns and Merrill Lynch, saving billions in likely resolution costs for taxpayers.

If the Democrats had let the 2005 legislation come to a vote, the huge growth in the subprime and Alt-A loan portfolios of Fannie and Freddie could not have occurred, and the scale of the financial meltdown would have been substantially less. The same politicians who today decry the lack of intervention to stop excess risk taking in 2005-2006 were the ones who blocked the only legislative effort that could have stopped it.

Mr. Calomiris is a professor of finance and economics at Columbia Business School and a scholar at the American Enterprise Institute. Mr. Wallison, a senior fellow at the American Enterprise Institute, was general counsel of the Treasury Department in the Reagan administration.

Please add your comments to the [Opinion Journal](#) forum.

MORE IN [OPINION](#)

 Email  Printer Friendly  Order Reprints

Share:    

Sponsored Links

5.62% Fixed Mortgage Refi

Refi your Mortgage Now! As Featured on CNNMoney & Forbes.
DeltaPrimeRefinance.com

Mortgage Joint Venture

Joint Venture for seasoned mortgage professionals.
www.branchpartner.com

House Payments Fall Again

\$180,000 Refi for \$679/mo. See Rates - No Credit Check Needed!
www.MortgageRatesExperts.com

Subscribe Now for Full Access to WSJ.com and Get

2 WEEKS FREE

SUBSCRIBE NOW

WSJ Subscriber's content provides:

- **Personalized** tracking of industries
- **Heard on the Street:** up-to-the-minute news and analysis that affects the markets and industries
- **Core business news:** "What's News" and new "Management" section

Related Articles and Blogs from WSJ.com

Sponsored by

Fannie, Freddie Share Spotlight in Mortgage
Mess OCT 16. 2008

Everybody Else Did It OCT 16. 2008

No Quick Fix for Housing Prices OCT 15. 2008

McCain Outlines New Economic Proposals OCT 14. 2008

Related News From the Web

Fannie, Freddie Become Hot Topic in Campaign OCT 09. 2008
washingtonpost.com

Your Money - Fannie, Freddie and You - What It Means to
the Public - NYTim... OCT 09. 2008
nytimes.com

Fannie Mae and the Federal Home Loan Bank of Chicago to
Provide Additional ... OCT 07. 2008
news.aol.com

Freddie, Fannie roll back fees OCT 03. 2008
money.cnn.com

Search News, Quotes, Companies



Log In or Subscribe to access your WSJ.com Account

Help & Information Center:

Help
Customer Service
Contact Us
New on WSJ.com
Tour the new Journal

About:

News Licensing
Advertising
Conferences
About Dow Jones
Privacy Policy - Updated
Subscriber Agreement &
Terms of Use - Updated
Copyright Policy
Jobs at WSJ.com

WSJ.com:

Site Map
Home
U.S.
World
Business
Markets
Market Data
Tech
Personal Finance
Life & Style
Opinion
Autos
Careers
Real Estate
Small Business
Corrections

Tools & Formats:

Today's Paper
Video Center
Graphics
Columns
Blogs
Alerts
Newsletters
Mobile
Podcasts
RSS Feeds
Journal Community
Forums